Building Sustainable Health Workforces in the WHO European Region

National Workforce Planning Conference
Dublin, Ireland
20th February 2019

Gabrielle Jacob
WHO Regional Office for Europe
About the WHO Regional Office for Europe
The Population Health Context

• Continuing challenges in tackling communicable diseases in some MS across the region

• Within the European Region the impact of the major NCDs accounts for an estimated 86% of the deaths and 77% of the disease burden.

• The population of the European Region is projected to increase only slightly by 2020 – from 894 million to 910 million – but then to return to current levels by 2050, but...
  – the number of working-age people is expected to decline steadily
  – the number of older people aged 85 years and older is projected to rise from 14 million to 40 million by 2050
  – Dementia prevalence is expected to double to around 20 million people by 2030

• Mental health disorders affect about 25% of the population every year and are more prevalent among the more vulnerable groups.
The HRH Context

- ‘Health systems can only operate if there is a health workforce’ (WHO/GHWA, 2013)
- The health and social care workforce is vital to provision of high quality services
- There is a worldwide shortage of health and social care workers and the situation is becoming more challenging globally and regionally
- WHO has forecast a worldwide 18 million shortfall by 2030, over twice the 7 million shortfall estimated in 2013
- Within the European Region there will be estimated (demand) shortage of 1.4m (WHO/GHO)
World Health Assembly Resolutions and Regional Committee Resolutions

2010
- Strengthening health workforce: strengthening nursing and midwifery (WHA64.7)

2011
- Transforming health professional education in support of universal health coverage (WHA66.23)

2013
- Follow-up of the Recife Political Declaration on Human Resources for Health: renewed commitments towards universal health coverage (WHA67.24)

2014
- Global strategy on human resources for health: workforce 2030 (WHA69.19)

2016
- Towards a sustainable health workforce in the WHO European Region: framework for action (EUR/RC67/R5)
Vision: Accelerate progress towards universal health coverage and the SDGs by ensuring equitable access to health workers within strengthened health systems

4 Objectives:
1. Optimize performance, quality and impact of the health workforce through evidence informed policies on HRH
2. Align investment in HRH with the current and future needs of the population and of health systems
3. Build institutional capacity at all levels for effective public policy stewardship, leadership and governance of HRH actions
4. Strengthen data on HRH

https://www.who.int/hrh/resources/global_strategy2030ru.pdf?ua=1
Health Labour Market Framework for UHC
The Regional Context: Health 2020

Sustainable health systems require an enhanced and transformed health workforce

- Transforming health services delivery
- Enhancing the health workforce
- Moving towards universal health coverage
- Ensuring equitable access to cost-effective medicines and health technologies
- Boosting health information
- Managing change and innovation
Overall goal of the framework

To accelerate progress towards the population health objectives of Health 2020 and longer-term health goals for Member States in the WHO European Region by sustaining a transformed and effective health workforce within strengthened health systems

Objectives and policy options

**Objective 1**
**EDUCATION AND PERFORMANCE:**
to transform professional, technical and vocational education and training and to optimize the performance, quality and impact of HRH

Policy options include:
- adapting transformative strategies for HRH education and training
- supporting health and developing the resilience of the workforce
- harnessing information and communication technology opportunities
- strengthening the capacity and quality of educational institutions through accreditation
- optimizing health worker motivation, satisfaction and retention
- promoting decent working conditions

**Objective 2**
**PLANNING AND INVESTMENT:**
to align investment in HRH with the current and future needs of the population and of health systems through effective planning

Policy options include:
- developing or improving HRH policies and strategies that quantify health workforce needs, demand and supply
- ensuring that tracking of international HRH flows is integrated in planning and policies on "managing" migration, and is used for monitoring the WHO Global Code of Practice
- catalysing multi-sectoral action on HRH issues

**Objective 3**
**CAPACITY BUILDING:**
to build the capacity of HRH-related institutions for effective policy stewardship, leadership and governance

Policy options include:
- maintaining an HRH unit or department
- aligning investments in health workforce education and health care provision with public health goals and population needs
- strengthening the institutional environment, governance and management of HRH education, regulation and performance

**Objective 4**
**ANALYSIS AND MONITORING:**
to improve the evidence base, strengthen data and applications to analytical approaches to HRH policy and planning

Policy options include:
- strengthening HRH information systems
- establishing and utilizing national health workforce registries
- putting in place incentives and policies to collect & analyse reliable HRH data
- ensuring transparency of, and access to, HRH data collection and reporting
- systematically monitoring progress on policy implementation and planning to identify the need for adaptation or change

Enablers for action

- Strong national leadership
- Evidence base (toolkit) and labour market analysis
- Strategic approach to managing change
- Political commitment

General cross-cutting considerations for Member States

| Take account of relevant specificities and policy priorities of the country; monitor progress and adapt | Use a multi-sectoral and inclusive multi-stakeholder approach | Collaborate at sub-regional, regional and international levels | Align with global initiatives, such as to improve HRH data and reporting |

*Examples of policy options are given; Member States will have to develop, review and prioritize from a broader list*
And a Resolution ... (EUR/RC67/R5)
The Toolkit

**Supports** Member States to assess their policies for health workforces within a local context

**Signposts** tools to aid progress and implementation of policies based around four Strategic Objectives

**“Makes it Real”** by using case study examples from the WHO European Region
4 Key Domains of the Toolkit

**Education and Performance**
- Skill-mix
- Transformative learning
- CPD
- Regulation & accreditation

**Planning and Investment**
- Investment in health systems
- Finance governance
- Investing in the workforce

**Capacity building**
- Stewardship, leadership and governance
- Improving HRH function
- Certifying and registering health professionals

**Analysis and monitoring**
- HRH assessment
- Monitoring
- Workforce planning
To transform professional, technical and vocational education and training and to optimize the performance, quality and impact of HRH through evidence-informed policies contributing to healthy lives and well-being, effective universal health coverage, and resilient and strengthened health systems at all levels.

Education and Performance

• Skill mix
• Transformative learning
• CPD
• Regulation and accreditation
To align investment in HRH with the current and future needs of the population and of health systems through effective planning.

This must take account of the **dynamics of the health labour market** and give consideration to approaches to **better align planning and investment in the workforce with service delivery priorities**. It will also necessitate using planning approaches to address identified shortages and to improve the distribution of health workers and skills mix.
To build the capacity of HRH-related institutions for effective policy stewardship, leadership and governance of actions in order to develop and to maintain a sustainable health workforce.

Capacity building

• Stewardship, leadership and governance
• Improving HRH function
• Certifying and registering health professionals
To improve the evidence base and to strengthen the data and applications that support analytical approaches to HRH policy and planning.

The *Global Strategy* sets out policy options for Member States on approaches to improve HRH data collection, reporting and analysis.
A Global Call for Strengthening HRH Data

1. **Optimize the existing workforce** in pursuit of the Sustainable Development Goals and universal health coverage (e.g. education, employment, retention)

2. **Anticipate and align investment in future workforce requirements** and plan the necessary changes (e.g. a fit for purpose, needs-based workforce)

3. **Strengthen individual and institutional capacity** to manage HRH policy, planning and implementation (e.g. migration and regulation)

4. **Strengthen data, evidence and knowledge** for cost-effective policy decisions (e.g. National Health Workforce Accounts)

**One vision:** Accelerate progress towards universal health coverage and the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development by ensuring equitable access to health workers within strengthened health systems

**Two goals:** Invest in both the expansion and transformation of the global health and social workforce

**Five workstreams:** To facilitate the implementation of intersectoral approaches and country-driven action and catalyse sustainable investments, capacity-building and policy action: (1) advocacy, social dialogue and policy dialogue; (2) data, evidence and accountability; (3) education, skills and jobs; (4) financing and investments; and (5) international labour mobility.
Health systems building blocks

HRHIS: a subsystem of HIS

- Financial Management System
- Alert and Response System
- EMR/Patient Management System
- Disease Management System
- HRH Information System
- Supply-chain Management System
- Environmental Monitoring System
- Asset Management System
- Diagnostics/Lab System
National Health Workforce Accounts

- A modular approach aligned with health labour market framework
- 78 indicators covering 10 modules to obtain comprehensive data on all aspects of health workforce and support health workforce governance and stewardship
- Different domains => different stakeholders required
NHWA: Why?

- Strengthen HRH information systems in countries
- Bringing together and establishing linkages between various indicators and HRH data collected by different stakeholders and sectors
- Support evidence informed decision making by providing quality and timely data and information for:
  - Answering policy questions
  - Informing development of national and sub-national health plans and strategies
  - Standardizing tools and methodologies across various stakeholders and data collections
Supports a Health Labour Market Framework Approach
Joint Data Collection Already Mapped to NHWA

1. Active health workforce stock
   - Health worker density
   - Health worker density at subnational level

2. Education and training
   - Applications
     - Master list of accredited health workforce education and training institutions
     - Duration of education and training
     - Applications for education and training
   - Admissions
     - Rate of admissions to available places
     - Rate of students to qualified educators for education and training
   - Exit / drop out
     - Exit / drop-out rate from education and training programmes

3. Health labour market flows
   - Entry into labour market
     - Graduate starting practice within one year
   - Exit from labour market
     - Voluntary exit rate from health labour market
     - Involuntary exit rate from health

4. Skill-mix composition for models of care
   - Sectoral workforce composition
     - Percentage of health workforce working in hospitals
     - Percentage of health workforce working in residential long-term care facilities
     - Percentage of health workforce working in ambulatory health care
   - Skill distribution
     - Specialist surgical workforce
     - Family medicine practitioners
     - Existence of advanced nursing roles
   - International health regulation capacity
     - Availability of human resources to implement national health regulations
     - Applied epidemiology training programme
NHWA – Selection of Indicators

- Applications for education and training (2-03)
- Exit / drop out rate from education/training programmes (2-06)
- CPD (3-08)
- Education financing (4-01 to 4-08)

- Graduates starting practice within 1 year (5-01)
- Entry rate of foreign workers (5-03)
- Measures to prevent attacks on health workers (6-09)
- Health workforce expenditure (7-01 to 7-07)

- Mechanisms to coordinate intersectoral workforce agenda (9-01)
- Health workforce planning processes (9-03)
- Education plans aligned with health plan (9-04)
- HRHIS (10-01 to 10-08)
2020 - a milestone year for the HRH policy agenda

- Regional Framework for Action reporting (RC71)
- Global HRH Strategy: 2020 milestones (WHA73)
- 3rd review of relevance / effectiveness of WHO Global Code (WHA73)
- Nursing Now and the Year of the Nurse
- 1st State of the World’s Nursing Report (WHA73)
- 3rd State of the World’s Midwifery Report (WHA73)
thank you