**Preparing a Shortlisting Guide**

This document is to help you draw up a shortlisting guide to support Selection Board members in their role. Hints and prompts are included in blue throughout the document. Adapt it to match your process depending on whether shortlisting is taking place at the same time as the eligibility sift stage or at a different date.

Documents you will need:

* Job Specification
* Application Form
* Selection process map

You will need to refer to your mapping of the selection process to complete the content of this guide. At the **Before You Recruit** stage, you will have decided what skill areas you will assess and where during the selection process.

The Shortlisting Guide should reflect the content and structure of the application form. Adapt this template to match the application form for your role. For example, if competency based questions were not included in your application form then remove them from your guide.

Include the eligibility criteria from the Job Specification that the Board will need to use to shortlist.

Use criteria for shortlisting that your candidates can demonstrate on an application form. For example, ‘Demonstrate effective communication and interpersonal skills’ is usually better suited to assessment during the interview rather than on an application form. However, the following can be included:

* Demonstrate evidence of leading a multi-disciplinary team
* Demonstrate project management experience
* Demonstrate evidence of implementing legislation into working practices
* Demonstrate evidence of staff management
* Demonstrate evidence of working in an acute setting

**Shortlisting Guide for < insert post name >**

**Date**

**Important Notice for Selection Board members**

This shortlisting guide provides support for the shortlisting stage of the **< insert post name >**. It provides clear outlines of the areas the Board will assess and guidelines for scoring.

This documentation is confidential and for restricted circulation only. The information contained in the guide is CONFIDENTIAL and for Board Members use ONLY. It should not be disclosed to ANY third parties and must not be reproduced in any way. This confidentiality requirement applies before, during and after this shortlisting process.

On completion of the shortlisting process, please immediately return this guide to the HR staff member dealing with the competition, and include the shortlisting results and other documents.

**<Guide number x of x>**

**Table of Contents**

[**Introduction** 4](#_Toc152852716)

[**Preparing to Sift/Shortlist** 5](#_Toc152852717)

[**Writing Summary Comments** 7](#_Toc152852718)

[**Scoring Guidelines** 8](#_Toc152852719)

[**Candidate Score Sheet** 9](#_Toc152852720)

# **Introduction**

Review the application form to assess key criteria for the role as described in the Job Specification.

The application form asked candidates to provide information on their eligibility and demonstrate how their skills, competence and knowledge meet the criteria for short listing.

* **Eligibility Criteria**

Assess each candidate based on the eligibility criteria as laid out in the Job Specification for the role.

Candidates deemed to have met the eligibility criteria will then be shortlisted to identify those must suitable to call forward to interview.

* **Shortlisting Criteria**

Shortlisting identifies those most likely to meet the standard required at the interview stage. It helps to make a manageable interview programme by selecting a reduced number of candidates for interview.

Shortlist all candidates who meet the agreed criteria. Do not decide on a number of candidates selected to suit a specific timeframe for interviews.

Short listing criteria must be job related and applied consistently across all candidates.

There must be a clear relationship between the experience, skills, competencies and knowledge listed on the Job Specification and the criteria used for short listing.

The job specification includes the following information:

*‘*Short listing may be carried out on the basis of information supplied in your Application Form. The criteria for short listing are based on the requirements of the post as outlined in the ‘eligibility criteria’ and ‘skills, competencies and/or knowledge section of this job specification. Therefore, it is very important that you think about your experience in light of those requirements. **Failure to include information regarding these requirements may result in you not being called forward to the next stage of the selection process.’**

You will need to consider all sections of the Job Specification. This includes the necessary skills needed to carry out the duties successfully and effectively.

Use only the evidence supplied in the application form. Decide if the candidate will be able to carry out the duties of the post in an effective manner.

There should be a clear link between what the candidate has achieved in their career to date and the requirements of the role.

Consider the quality of experience and not the length of experience. Decide if the depth and breadth of the candidate’s experience will allow the candidate carry out the duties of the post successfully.

Factors to take into account include:

* range and practical nature of the experience
* personal contribution and value added in relevant areas
* level of achievement of the particular candidate

Pay close attention to the complexity of the candidate’s experience when assessing for posts that are more senior.

# **Preparing to Sift/Shortlist**

Before starting this stage, you will need to:

* know the assessment criteria as detailed in the Job Specification
* read and sign the Confidentiality Agreement and Conflict of Interest Declaration Form
* read and understand the approach to assessment, the Suitability of Evidence Scale, and the Assessment & Summary Record Sheet

Use the Suitability of Evidence Scale for assessing the information provided by candidates **to consider calling forward for interview.** The ‘Sufficient Evidence’ scale is further broken down as an aid to Board Members in making an assessment decision.

Board Members only indicate if a candidate is suitable to call forward to interview or not, based on whether the evidence they provided is ‘sufficient’ or ‘insufficient’ across the skill/question areas.

**Suitability of Evidence Scale**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Insufficient Evidence** | **Sufficient Evidence** |
| **Not Very Suitable**evidence of this key skill area presented | **Adequate**evidence of this skill area presented | **Very Suitable**evidence of this key skill area presented |

If there is a large candidate pool, it might be worth considering only calling candidates deemed ‘Very Suitable’ forward. This must be decided **before the Selection Boards begin the shortlisting process.**

If the candidate pool is very large or if you wish to create an order of merit, you can use numbers rather than descriptors in the Suitability of Evidence Scale boxes. See the example below:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Insufficient Evidence** | **Sufficient Evidence** |
| **Inadequate**evidence of this key skill area presented | **Adequate**evidence of this skill area presented | **Good**Evidence of this skill area presented | **Very Good** evidence of this key skill area presented |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **6** | **7** |

**Steps before the shortlisting board meeting**

Before meeting with the rest of the selection board, you should complete an initial review of the application forms and make preliminary decisions as to which candidates are ‘suitable’, and ‘unsuitable’ to be called forward to interview.

When reviewing the responses provided by candidates, you must:

1. assess the areas for shortlisting using the guidelines provided
2. make your assessments on how the evidence presented compares against the criteria for the role and the suitability of this evidence
3. not compare candidates against each other
4. use only the evidence presented in the application form
5. assess the information provided under each question area in isolation
6. not allow the candidate’s career history to date influence your assessment on the competency areas

You might find the following tips useful:

1. It is good practice to assess one skill / question area at a time. This will allow you to become more familiar with each area you are assessing and the criteria associated with effective performance in this area. It should also allow for greater consistency in your own assessments.
2. Divide them in to 3 candidate categories:
* Highly likely to be called to interview (probably in)
* Highly unlikely to be called to interview (probably out)
* Somewhere in between (maybe)

Discuss these in detail during the shortlisting board meeting.

**Shortlisting Board meeting**

The shortlisting board must:

1. agree a final decision for each candidate , that is to call them forward to interview or not.
2. not shortlist a candidate awarded an insufficient mark in one or more areas.
3. complete a final assessment and summary comment sheet for each candidate.

# **Writing Summary Comments**

Complete a summary comment for all candidates, whether shortlisted or not. Summary comments should clearly reflect the short listing criteria. It should be approximately four lines in length, clearly indicate the candidate’s strengths, limitations and suggestions of how better evidence can be provided. Offer a brief summary of how the assessment process.

**Summary Comment Sheet**

This sheet records the assessment award for each question area and an overall summary comment of 3-4 lines to explain the decision.

It is important that the comment is descriptive, accurate and clearly relates to the evidence the candidate presented on the application form. Comments should clearly reflect the shortlisting criteria and represent the consensus view of the board.

When writing summary comments for candidates who did not make the shortlist, refer to areas in which they may need to provide additional evidence of a particular behaviour. Send this information to candidates as feedback.

Below are some example formats for Summary Comments:

Shortlisted:

* From the information provided the candidate has shown good evidence of leading a team, project management and working with multiple stakeholders.
* On their Application Form, the candidate has demonstrated depth and complexity of experience working at a senior management level, especially in the area of implementing change and working in partnership with stakeholders.

Not shortlisted:

* On the Application Form, the candidate did not demonstrate sufficient evidence of managing a team. This is essential experience for this post. The candidate would benefit from further experience in leading a team.
* On the Application Form, the candidate did not demonstrate sufficient depth and breadth of senior management experience. While the candidate has worked as a manager, this experience relates to working primarily with one discipline. This position requires a high level of multi stakeholder working. The candidate would benefit from further experience in multi-stakeholder/disciplinary working.
* On the Application Form, the candidate does not display sufficient depth and breadth of experience in working in an acute setting. The candidate has limited experience working in an acute setting. They would benefit from further experience in this area. The candidate also shows limited experience in multi-disciplinary working which is a key requirement of this role.
* From the information provided in the Application Form, the candidate does not show that they have sufficient experience in leading others through a change process, which is an important element of the job. The candidate does show they have worked in a changing environment but does not show sufficient evidence of promoting and leading change.

# **Scoring Guidelines**

**Eligibility Criteria**

Include here the Eligibility Criteria for the role as they appear in the Job Specification

**Shortlisting**

Include the areas for assessment during the shortlisting process.

For competency-based shortlisting, include the competency title, summary description and behavioural indicators for each competency area the board will assess.

**Example 1**

Previous Experience - Management/Admin type role

Behavioural Indicators might include:

* Operates at an appropriate level
* Demonstrates an acceptable range and breadth of experience
* Has an appropriate balance of skills and experience required for the role

**Example 2**

Competency Based Question: Organisation & Management Skills for Public Health Nurse

Behavioural Indicators might include:

* Demonstrates evidence of effective planning and organising skills
* Demonstrates the ability to manage deadlines and effectively handle multiple tasks
* Demonstrates an awareness of resource management and the importance of value for money
* Assigns tasks and supervises as appropriateto other members of the nursing team
* Plans ahead to cover foreseeable demands and eventualities

It is useful for Board Members if you repeat the rating scale underneath the competencies on each page.

**< Insert site / Location >**

**< Insert Campaign Name & Date >**

# **Candidate Score Sheet**

**Eligibility and / or Shortlisting Process**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Candidate Name:**  | **Candidate Number:**  |
| **Stage 1: ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA** | **Ineligible** | **Eligible** |
|  |  |  |
| **AND** |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| **AND** |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| **Summary Comment:** |

**Candidates must have met the eligibility criteria (Stage1) to eligible for shortlisting phase (Stage 2)**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Stage 2: SHORTLISTING CRITERIA****Candidates must provide sufficient evidence in all criteria areas to be called forward to interview** | **Insufficient evidence** | **Sufficient****evidence** |
| **Summary Comment:**  |  |  |

**Overall Assessment: Call to Interview (please TICK appropriate box) Yes** [ ]  **No** [ ]

**Eligibility Board / Shortlisting Board**

|  |
| --- |
| **The sift was undertaken by < name, title, location >** **< Insert other relevant details >****Facilitated by < Insert details >** |
| **Signatures:** **Date:**  |